Complex & Intelligent Systems

Shortest Path Problem in Fuzzy, Intuitionistic Fuzzy and Neutrosophic Environment: An Overview --Manuscript Draft--

Manuscript Number:	CAIS-D-18-00106		
Full Title:	Shortest Path Problem in Fuzzy, Intuitionistic Fuzzy and Neutrosophic Environment: An Overview		
Article Type:	S.I.: Neutrosophic MCDM		
Funding Information:			
Abstract:	In the last decade, concealed by uncertain atmosphere, many algorithm have been studied deeply to workout shortest path problem (SPP). In this paper, we compared shortest path problem with various existing algorithm. Finally we concluded the best algorithm for certain environment.		
Corresponding Author:	Said Broumi University Hassan II MOROCCO		
Corresponding Author Secondary Information:			
Corresponding Author's Institution:	University Hassan II		
Corresponding Author's Secondary Institution:			
First Author:	Said Broumi		
First Author Secondary Information:			
Order of Authors:	Said Broumi		
	Mohamed Talea, phd		
	Assia Bakali, phd		
	Florentin Smarandache, phd		
	MALAYALAN Lathamaheswari, phd		
	DEIVANAYAGAMPILLAI Nagarajan, phd		
	Mani Parimala, phd		
Order of Authors Secondary Information:			
Author Comments:	the article ins not published in any journals		
Suggested Reviewers:	Faruk KARAASLAN, phd prof, Çankırı Karatekin University karaaslan.faruk@gmail.com He has many paper on neutrosophic sets		
	Santanu Kumar Patro, phd prof, Berhampur University ksantanupatro@gmail.com he has many papers on neutrosophic sets		
	Yanhui Guo, phd prof, University of Illinois at Springfield guoyanhui@gmail.com he has many papers on neutrosophic theory		

Shortest Path Problem in Fuzzy, Intuitionistic Fuzzy and Neutrosophic Environment: An Overview

Said Broumi¹, Mohamed Talea³, Assia Bakali² ,Florentin Smarandache⁴ , Deivanayagampillai Nagarajan⁵, Malayalan Lathamaheswari⁶, Mani Parimala⁷

^{1,3}Laboratory of Information processing, Faculty of Science Ben M'Sik, University Hassan II, B.P 7955, Sidi Othman, Casablanca, Morocco

broumisaid78@gmail.com,taleamohamed@yahoo.fr

²Ecole Royale Navale, Boulevard Sour Jdid, B.P 16303 Casablanca, Morocco, assiabakali@yahoo.fr

⁴Department of Mathematics, University of New Mexico, 705 Gurley Avenue, Gallup, NM 87301, USA fsmarandache@gmail.com

^{5,6}Department of Mathematics Hindustan Institute of Technology & Science, Chennai-603 103, India dnrmsu2002@yahoo.com, lathamax@gmail.com

⁷Department of Mathematics, Bannari Amman Institute of Technology,

Sathyamangalam-638401, Tamil Nadu, India.

Email: rishwanthpari@gmail.com.

Click here to view linked References

Shortest Path Problem in Fuzzy, Intuitionistic Fuzzy and Neutrosophic Environment: An Overview

Abstract—In the last decade, concealed by uncertain atmosphere, many algorithm have been studied deeply to workout shortest path problem (SPP). In this paper, we compared shortest path problem with various existing algorithm. Finally we concluded the best algorithm for certain environment.

Keywords— Fuzzy sets; Intuitionistic Fuzzy Sets; Vague sets; Neutrosophic sets; Shortest Path Problem.

I.Introduction

SPP is a cardinal issue among familiar connectional problems which occur in different areas of engineering and science such as application in highway networks, portage and conquer in intelligence channels and problem of scheduling. The SPP focuses on recommending the path which has minimum length enclosed by two vertices. The length of the arc/edge produces the quantities of the real life namely cost, time etc. In the case of conventional method of measuring SP, the length of each bend is assumed as a crisp numbers. If there is an uncertain on the parameters in the network then the length can be represented by fuzzy number.

In the current preceding, many of the SPP with various types of input data, have been examined in junction with fuzzy, intuitionistic, vague, interval fuzzy, interval valued Intuitionistic fuzzy and neutrosophic sets [2, 3, 8-9, 11,13-14,18-20,23,30, 39, 46-52, 83-92]. Up until now plenty of new algorithms have been designed.

The paper is arranged as: Section II comprehends the primary definitions and overviewed SPP under different sets in section III, IV, V and VI respectively. Lastly conclusion has been presented for the objective of the paper.

II.Preliminaries

Here, we principally recollected some of the concepts connected to neutrosophic sets (NSs), single valued neutrosophic sets (SVNSs) related to the present work. See especially [10, 12] for further details and background.

Definition 2.1. Consider the space X consists of universal elements characterized by x. The NS A is a phenomenon which has the structure $A = \{(T_A(x), I_A(x), F_A(x)) | x \in X\}$ where the three grades of memberships are from X to $]^-0,1^+[$ of the element $x \in X$ to the set A, with the criterion:

$$^{-}0 \le T_A(x) + I_A(x) + F_A(x) \le 3^{+}. \tag{1}$$

The functions $T_A(x)$, $I_A(x)$ and $F_A(x)$ are the truth, indeterminate and falsity grades lies in real standard/non-standard subsets of $[0, 1]^+$.

Since there is a complication of applying NSs to realistic issues, Samarandache and Wang wt al. [11-12] proposed the notion of SVNS, which is a specimen of NS and it is useful for realistic applications of all the fields.

Definition 2.2. For the space X of objects contains a global elements x. A SVNS is represented by degrees of membership grades mentioned in Def. 2.1. For all x in $X, T_A(x), I_A(x), F_A(x) \in [0, 1]$. A SVNS can be written as

$$A = \{ \langle x : T_A(x), I_A(x), F_A(x) \rangle / x \in X \}$$
 (2)

III. SPP in vague Environment

A peculiar way for getting a shortest path (SP) of a given network was found by Dou et al.[26] in 2008, where the sets are vague. Firstly, the authors recommended the length of the SP was determined using vague sets from the source node (SN) to the destination node (DN) for conventional network with direction. Secondly, calculated the degree of resemblance among the lengths of the vague paths under vague similarity measure. Finally, it was concluded that the path which has the greater degree of similarity is a SP. A novel algorithm was constructed to identify the SP in a directed graph (DG), where the distance between the arcs is considered as vague number in triangular measure rather than real number. In 2018, Rashmanlou et al. solved SPP using Euclidean distance for vague network [57].

IV. SPP in Fuzzy Environment.

This part describes about various methods to solve SPP using fuzzy arc length by many authors. Dudois and Prade solved fuzzy SPP (FSPP) using Floyd's and Ford's algorithms firstly [5]. In the year 2000, Okada and soper introduced an algorithm to solve FSPP in terms of multiple labeling procedure [32]. Klein [27] projected a vital programming fuzzy algorithm based on recursive concept. Lin [41] constructed a technique of fuzzy linear programming to find the fuzzy SP (FSPP) length of a network. Yao [42] contemplated two different FSPP such as SPP using triangular fuzzy numbers (TFNs) and SPP using level $(1-\beta, 1-\alpha)$ interval valued fuzzy numbers (IVFNs).

In 2003, the same author, solved FSSP by using two different types of methods namely TFNs and level $(1-\beta,1-\alpha)$ interval valued FNs (IVFNs). Nayeem and Pal introduced an algorithm to solve SPP using notoriety index, where the lengths of the arc were taken as interval numbers or TFNs. [44]. In the year 2005, Chuang recommended a novel idea to identify FSP by finding the length of the FSP encompassed by all possible path of a given network [38].Kung et al. established new technique to handle FSPP by representing the arc length as TFN [40]. In 2009, Yadav and Biswas conferred a new method to solve SPP by considering the edge length as FN in a directed graph instead of real number. The authors constructed an algorithm to discover an optimal path by considering both input and output are FNs [22]. Also in the same period, Lin solved SPP using interval valued FNs and endorsed distance method of defuzzification [62]. In 2010, Pandian and Rajendran introduced path classification algorithm to find the minimal path by considering crisp or uncertain weights (TFNs) from one node to another. In this method indeterminate nodes in the minimum path can be found without going backward and this is the major advantage. This would be very helpful for the decision-makers to omit indeterminate nodes [28]. Seda presented all-pairs SPP by applying fuzzy ranking method [25]. In 2012, Meenakshi and Kaliraja determined SP for IVFN (Interval Valued Fuzzy Network) [61].

In 2013, Shukla projected Floyd's algorithm to solve SPP using a concept of fuzzy sets which is based on graded mean unification of FNs [21]. In 2014, Elizabeth and Sujatha introduced a novel approach to solve FSPP by finding minimum arithmetic mean among IVFN matrices [31]. The same authors Huyen et al. gave a direction on establishing a design for SPP with TFNs as the edge weights. In this work, mathematical concept of the algorithm is developed on Defined Strict Comparative Relation Function for the set of TFNs [56]. Nayeem proposed a novel expected value algorithm for the FSSP [60].

In 2015, Mukerje [34] explored the fuzzy approach programming to solve FSPP. Here the authors converted a single-objective fuzzy linear programming (SOFLP) by considering TFNs and TpFNs as the edge weight into crisp multi-objective Linear Programming (CMOLP). Anusuva and Sathya proposed a design for SPP where the arc lengths are type-2 fuzzy numbers (T2FNs) from SN to DN in a network 54]. Also the authors established an algorithm for SPP using type reduction on the edges using centroid and centre of gravity of FS which gives the FSP where the arc lengths are represented by discrete T2FN [55]. Mahdavi et al. [16] applied dynamic programming method for finding shortest chain in a fuzzy network. In [33] Okada solved FSPPs by incorporating interactivity among path. Deng et al. [53] established fuzzy Dijikstra algorithm for solving SPP under uncertain environment. Dev et al. have contributed the following ideas: solved FSPP using IT2FSs (interval type-2 fuzzy set) as the edge weights, they have altered conventional Dijikstra's design by including impreciseness using IT2FSs to solve SPP from SN to DN, afford a new way for SPP in imprecise setting using IT2FSs for the edge weights and examined the path algebra and its generalized algorithm for FSPP [6]. Meenakshi and Kaliraja described the SP for a network under the notion of interval valued fuzzy (IVF) where the SP in lower limit fuzzy networks coexists with the case for upper limit [7]. In 2016, Dey et al. introduced a model to solve FSPP for using Interval Type-2 Fuzzy (IT2F) [59]. In 2017, Biswas proposed IVFSP in a multi graph [63]. In 2018, Eshaghnezhad et al. presented a first scientific paper for resolving of FSP by artificial network model which has the property of the global exponential stability [82].

V. SPP in Intuitionistic Fuzzy Environment.

In this part, various methods have been disclosed in literature to handle the SPP by taking intuitionistic fuzzy (IF) as the arc lengths by different authors.

In 2007, Karunambigai et al. refined an approach found on dynamic programming to solve SPP using intuitionistic fuzzy graphs (IFGs) [24]. In 2010, Gani also established a technique to identify intuitionistic fuzzy shortest path (IFSP) for a given network [3]. Mukherje pre-owned an interesting methodology to solve IFSPP using the idea of Dijikstra's algorithm and intuitionistic fuzzy hybrid Geometric (IFHG) operator [45]. Majudmder and Pal [30] solved SPP for intuitionistic fuzzy network. In 2013, Biswas modified an IF method for SPP in a realistic multi graph [35]. Rangasamy at al. proposed score-based methodology to find shortest hyper paths for a given network where hyper edges are characterized by IF weights without describing similarity measure and Euclidean distance [43]. Babacioru conferred an algorithm to find the minimum arc length of an IF hyper path using MAPLE [15]. In [29], Jayagowri and GeethaRamani solved SPP on a network with the use of Trapezoidal Intuitionistic Fuzzy Numbers (TpFNs). In 2014, Porchelvi and Sudha recommended a minimum path labeling algorithm to solve SPP using triangular IF number (TIFN) [36]. Also they proposed a new and different methodology to solve SPP with TIFNs, where the authors found the minimal edge using IF distance by applying graded mean integration and examined SPP from a particular vertex to all other ones in a network [37]. In 2015, Kumar et al. suggested a design to identify the SP and shortest distance in an IVIF graph where the nodes are taken as crisp numbers and edge weights are assigned by IVITpFNs (Interval Valued Intuitionistic Trapezoidal Fuzzy Numbers) [1]. Kumar et al. proposed an algorithm for SPP using IVITpFN as the weights in a network [58].

IV. SPP in Neutrosophic Environment.

The authors modeled a design to find the ideal path where the inputs and outputs are neutrosophic numbers (NNs) [4]. In 2016, Broumi et al. solved SPP, by considering the edge weights as, SVTpNNs as the edge weights [68], Triangular fuzzy neutrosophic numbers (TFNNs) [69], bipolar neutrosophic set [70] and applied Dijikstra's method to solve NSPP and IVNSPP [67, 72]. In 2017, Broumi et al.solved SPP using SVNGs [64], by adopting SVTNNs and SVTpNNs [65-66], found an optimal solution for the NSPP using trapezoidal data under neutrosophic environment [68], by SVNN, solved the MST problem [73], by Trapezoidal fuzzy neutrosophic [74], introduced a new notion of matrix design for MST in IVNG [79], introduced computational method to MST in IV bipolar neutrosophic setting [80]. Also in [75], Broumi et al. proposed an another algorithm to solve MST problem on a network with the use of SVTpNNs. Broumi et al. [76] solved MST problem in a bipolar neutrosophic environment. Mullai et al. solved SPP by minimal spanning tree (MST) using BNS [77]. In 2018, Broumi et al. applied IVNNs and BNS SPP for a given network [70,71]. Dey et al. proposed a novel design for MST for NGs which are undirected [78]. Jeyanthi and Radhika [81] solved NSPP using Floyd's algorithm firstly.

The following table confers four types of SPP containing FSPP, IFSPP and neutrosophic SPP (NSPP) and for the case of interval numbers to all the types of parameters.

Shortest path problem on network with	Edges/vertices	Indeterminacy	Ambiguity	Uncertainty
Crisp parameters	Crisp Number (CN)	No	No	No
Interval Parameters	Interval Number (IN)	No	No	No
Fuzzy parameters (FPs)	Fuzzy Number (FN)	No	No	Yes
Interval FPs	Interval Fuzzy Number (IFN)	No	No	Yes more level
Intuitionistic fuzzy parameters (IFPs)	Intuitionistic Fuzzy Number (IFN)	No	yes	Yes
Interval IFPs	Interval Intuitionistic Fuzzy Number (IFN)	No	yes more level	yes more level
Neutrosophic parameters (NPs)	Neutrosophic Number (NN)	yes	yes	Yes
Interval NPs	Interval Neutrosophic Number (INN)	yes more level	yes more level	yes more level

From the overhead table, it is seen that the available methods could not employed to solve NSPP from SN to DN for a given network with IVNN as the edge weights.

But neutrosophic environment can able to solve SPP effectively as it handles indeterminacy together with impreciseness and ambiguity to take the best decision in identifying the SP with the use of IVNN rather than single valued NN. Effortlessly the proposed algorithm can be adapted to any kind of NNs.

V. Advantages and limitations of different types of sets.

The below table expresses the capacity of various types of sets as an advantage and their incapability to handle some conditions or important situations towards to realistic problems.

Various Types of Sets	Advantages	Limitations
Crisp sets	Can accurately	Cannot describe the uncertain
	determine with no	Information
	hesitation	
Fuzzy sets	Can describe the	Cannot describe the uncertain
	uncertain	Information with non-membership degree
	Information	
Interval valued fuzzy sets	Can able to deal interval	Cannot handle the uncertain
	data instead of exact data	Information with non-membership degree

Intuitionistic fuzzy sets	Can describe the	Cannot describe the sum of MS and NMS degrees bigger than 1
•	uncertain	
	Information with	
	membership (MS) and	
	non-membership (NMS)	
	degrees simultaneously	
Interval valued Intuitionistic	Able to handle interval	Cannot portray the addition of MS and NMS degrees bigger than 1
fuzzy sets	data	
Vague sets	Can describe uncertain	Cannot describe the sum of MS and NMS degrees greater than 1.
	Information with grades	
	of MS and NMS at the	
	same time.	
Pythagorean fuzzy sets	It has full space to	Cannot describe the square sum of MS and NMS degrees greater
	describe the sum of MS	than 1
	and NMS degrees	
	greater than 1	
Interval valued Pythagorean	Capable of dealing	Unable to define the square sum of MS and NMS degrees greater
fuzzy sets	interval data	than 1
Neutrosophic Sets	Able to deal	Unable to handle interval data
	indeterminacy of the	
	data and the optimized	
	solution can be obtained	
	completely.	
Interval valued Neutrosophic	Able to deal	Unable to handle incomplete weight information
sets	indeterminacy of the	
	interval data and the	
	optimized solution can	
	be obtained .	

V. CONCLUSION

Crisp SPP (CSPP) can be adopted only if there exists certainty on the parameters of nodes and edges. If uncertainty exist in the arc then the authors have been recommended to use FSPP. Later FSPPs cannot be enforced for the certain message which is not endured and indecisive then the investigation invented the concept of IFSPP. Later, the data about of the arc is undetermined, undecided and imprecise then the concept of NSP elevated in the literature. But all the algorithm established by the researchers is advantageous for various real time problems and occasionally the algorithm is not applicable for assured situations. Hence it is forced the recognized algorithms in various sets such as vague set (VS), FS, IFS and NS. In real world, one who clears with the data can accept the proposed algorithm by the inventors which is acceptable.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors are very grateful to the chief editor and reviewers for their comments and suggestions, which is helpful in improving the paper.

REFERENCES

- Applied Mathematics, Vol. 6, Issue 2, 2011, pp. 602 619.

 [2] A. Kumar and M. Kaue, S. L. C. A. Kumar and M. Kaur, A New Algorithm for Solving Shortest Path Problem on a Network with Imprecise Edge Weight, Applications and
- A. Kumar and M. Kaur, Solution of fuzzy maximal flow problems using fuzzy linear programming. World Academy of Science and Technology, 87, 2011, pp.28-31.
- A.N.Gani, On searching intuitionistic fuzzy shortest path in a network, Applied Mathematical Sciences, 69(4), 2010, pp.3447-3454.
- A.Thamaraiselvi and R.Santhi, A New Approach for Optimization of Real Life Transportation Problems in Neutrosophic Environment, Mathematical Problems in Enginnering, 2016, 9 pages.
- D. Dubois and H. Prade, Fuzzy Sets and Systems: Theory and Application, Academic Press, New work, 1980.
- A. Dey, A. Pal and T. Pal, Interval Type 2 Fuzzy Set in Fuzzy Shortest Path Problem, Mathematics, 4, 62, 2016, pp. 1-19.
- A.R Meenakshi and M.Kaliraja, Determination of the shortest path in interval valued fuzzy networks, International Journal of Mathematical Archive, 3 (6), 2012, pp.2377-2384.
- F. Smarandache, Refined Literal Indeterminacy and the Multiplication Law of Sub-Indeterminacies, Neutrosophic Sets and Systems, Vol. 9, 2015, [8]
- F. Smarandache, Types of Neutrosophic Graphs and neutrosophicAlgebraicStructures together with their Applications in Technology, seminar, Universitatea Transilvania din Brasov, Facultatea de Design de Produssi Mediu, Brasov, Romania 06 June 2015.

7

8

11

12

13

14

15

20

21

22

23

24

26

27

28

29

30 31

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

47

50

51

59

- [10] F. Smarandache, Neutrosophic set a generalization of the intuitionistic fuzzy set, Granular Computing, 2006 IEEE International Conference, 2006, p. 38 – 42.
- [11] F. Smarandache, A geometric interpretation of the neutrosophic set A generalization of the intuitionistic fuzzy set, Granular Computing (GrC), 2011 IEEE International Conference, 2011, pp.602-606.
- [12] H. Wang, F. Smarandache, Y. Zhang, and R. Sunderraman, Single valued Neutrosophic Sets, Multisspace and Multistructure 4, 2010, pp. 410-413.
- [13] H. Wang, F. Smarandache, Zhang, Y.-Q. and R. Sunderraman, Interval Neutrosophic Sets and Logic: Theory and Applications in Computing, Hexis, Phoenix, AZ, 2005.
- $I.\ Turksen,\ Interval\ valued\ fuzzy\ sets\ based\ on\ normal\ forms,\ Fuzzy\ Sets\ and\ Systems,\ vol.\ 20,\ 1986,\ pp.\ 191-210.$
- 9 [15] I. C. Barbacioru, Using Maple for Determination minimum are length of an intuitionistic fuzzy hyperpath, Annals of the CanstantinBrzncusi University of 10 TarguJiu, Engineering Series, No 4, 2016, pp.81-85.
 - [16] I. Mahdavi, R.Nourifar, A.Heidarzade and N.M. Amiri, A dynamic programming approach for finding shortest chains in a fuzzy network. Applied Soft Computing, Vol 9, 2009, pp. 503-511.
 - J. Ye, Single-Valued Neutrosophic Minimum Spanning Tree and Its Clustering Method, Journal of Intelligent Systems 23(3), 2014, pp. 311-324.
 - 18 K. Atanassov, Intuitionistic fuzzy sets. Fuzzy Sets and Systems, vol. 20, 1986, pp. 87-96.
 - K. Atanassov, Intuitionistic fuzzy sets: theory and applications, Physica, New York, 1999.
 - [20] K. Atanassov and G. Gargov, Interval valued intuitionistic fuzzy sets, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, vol.31, 1989, pp. 343-349.
- K.T.Shukla, Fuzzy Floyd's Algorithm to find shortest route between nodes under uncertain environment, International Journal of Mathematics and [21] 16 Computer Applications Research, Vol.3, issue5, 2013, pp.34-54.
- 17 [22] K. Yadav and R.Biswas, On Searching Fuzzy Shortest Path In a Network, International Journal of Recent Trends in Engineering, Vol 2, No. 3, 2009,pp.16-18
- [23] L. Zadeh, Fuzzy sets. Inform and Control, 8, 1965, pp.338-353. 19
 - [24] M.G. Karunambigai; P.Rangasamy, K.Atanassov and N. Palaniappan, An intuitionistic fuzzy graph method for finding the shortest path in networks, Advances Soft Computing, 42, 2007, pp.3-10.
 - [25] Seda, Fuzzy all-pair shortest path problem. Proceedings of the Computational Intelligence, Theory and Applications International Conference 9th Fuzzy Days in Dortmund, September 18-20, 2006, Germany, pp. 395-404.
 - [26] Y. Dou, H. Guo and J. Zho, On the shortest path to solve the problem base on vague sets, Fifth International Conference on Fuzzy Systems and Knowledge Discovery IEEE, 2008, pp.85-89.
- 25 [27] C.M. Klein, Fuzzy shortest paths, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, 39, 1991, pp.27-41.
 - [28] P. Pandian and P.Rajendran, A new algorithm for Minimum path in a network, Applied Mathematical science, Vol.4, No.54, 2010, pp.2697-2710.
 - [29] P. Jayagowri and G. GeethaRamani, Using Trapezoidal Intuitionistic Fuzzy Number to Find Optimized Path in a Network, Advances in Fuzzy Systems, 2014, 6 pages.
 - [30] S. Majumder and A. Pal, Shortest Path Problem on Intuitionistic Fuzzy Network, Annals of Pure and Applied Mathematics, Vol. 5, No. 1, November 2013, pp. 26-36. [31] S. Elizabeth, L. Sujatha, Fuzzy Shortest path problem based on interval valued fuzzy numbers matrices, IJMSEA, Vol.8, No. 1, 2014, pp.325-335.

 - [32] S. Okada, T.Soper, A shortest path problem on network with fuzzy arc length, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, 109, 2000, pp.129-140.
- 32 [33] S. Okada, Fuzzy shortest path problems incorporating interactivity among path, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, 142, 2004, pp.335-357.
 - [34] S. Mukherjee, Fuzzy programming technique for solving the shortest path problem on networks under triangular and trapezoidal fuzzy environment, International Journal of Mathematics in Operational research, Vol.7, 2015, pp.576-549.
 - [35] S. S. Biswas, B. Alam and M.N.Doja, Real time multigraph for communication network: An intuitionistic fuzzy mathematical Model, Journal of Computer Science, 9 (7), 2013, pp.847-855.
 - [36] S. Porchelvi and G. Sudha, A new approach for finding Minimum path in a network using triangular intuitionistic fuzzy number, International Journal of Current Research, Vol.6, issue 8, 2014, pp.8103-8109.
 - [37] R. S. Porchelvi and G. Sudha, Modified Approach on Shortest Path in Intuitionistic Fuzzy Environment, Indian Journal of Applied Research, Volume 4, Issue9, 2014, pp.341-342.
 - [38] T.N. Chuang and J. Y. Kung, The fuzzy shortest path length and the corresponding shortest path in a network, computers and Operations Research, 32, 2005,pp.1409-1428.
 - T. N. Chuang and J. Y.Kung, A new algorithm for the discrete shortest path problem in a network, Appl.Math.Comput, 174, 2006, pp.1660-1668.
- 42 [40] J. Y. Kung, T.N.Hiang and C.T.Lin, Decision making on anetwork problem with fuzzy arc length, IMACS multiconference on computational engineering 43 in System Application (CESA), October 4-6, Bejing, China, 2006.
 - K. Lin and M. Chen, The fuzzy shortest path problem and its most vital arcs, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, 58, 1994, pp.343-353.
- 44 [42] J.S. Yao and F. T. Lin, Fuzzy shortest path network problems with uncertain edge weights, Journal of Information Science and Engineering, 19, 2003, pp. 45 329-351. 46
 - [43] P. Rangasamy, M. Akram and S.Thilagavathi, Intuitionistic Fuzzy Shortest hyperpath in a network, Information Processing Letters, 113, 2013, 599-603.
 - S.M.Nayeem and M. Pal, Shortest path problem on a network with imprecise edge weight, Fuzzy Optimization and Decision Making, 4, 2005, pp.293-312.
- 48 S. Mukherjee, Dijikstra's algorithm for solving the shortest path problem on networks under intuitionistic fuzzy environment, J.Math.Model.Algorithm, 11, 2012, pp.345-359. 49
 - S. Broumi, M. Talea, A. Bakali, F. Smarandache, "Single Valued Neutrosophic Graphs," Journal of New Theory, N 10, 2016, pp. 86-101.
 - S. Broumi, M. Talea, A. Bakali, F. Smarandache, "On Bipolar Single Valued Neutrosophic Graphs," *Journal of New Theory*, N11, 2016, pp.84-102.
 - S. Broumi, M. Talea, A. Bakali, F. Smarandache, Interval Valued Neutrosophic Graphs, SISOM & ACOUSTICS 2016, Bucharest 12-13 May, pp.79-91.
- 52 [49] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea, and F. Smarandache, Isolated Single Valued Neutrosophic Graphs. Neutrosophic Sets and Systems, Vol. 11, 2016, pp.74-53
- [50] S. Broumi, F. Smarandache, M. Talea and A. Bakali, An Introduction to Bipolar Single Valued Neutrosophic Graph Theory. Applied Mechanics and 54 Materials, vol.841, 2016, pp.184-191.
- 55 [51] S. Broumi, M. Talea, F. Smarandache and A. Bakali, Single Valued Neutrosophic Graphs: Degree, Order and Size. IEEE International Conference on 56 Fuzzy Systems (FUZZ), 2016, pp.2444-2451.
- [52] S. Broumi, F. Smarandache, "New distance and similarity measures of interval neutrosophic sets," Information Fusion (FUSION), 2014 IEEE 17th 57 International Conference, 2014, pp.1 – 7. 58
 - [53] Y. Deng, Y. Zhang and S. Mahadevan, Fuzzy Dijikstra algorithm for shortest path problem under uncertain environment. Appl. Soft Comput. 12, 2012, pp.1231-1237. [54] V. Anusuya and R.Sathya, Type-2 Fuzzy Shortest Path, International. Journal of Fuzzy Mathematical Archive, Vol. 2, 2013, pp.36-42.
- 60

4

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

- [55] V. Anusuya and R.Sathya, Type Reduction On Fuzzy Shortest Path Problem, IJMCAR, Vol. 4, Issue 6, Dec 2014, pp. 53-60.
- [56] V.T.T.Huyen, N.T.Luan and L.M.Tuan, Fuzzy shortest path algorithm based on comparative relation. International Journal of Computer Science and Network Security, Vol 14, No.5, 2014, pp.20-25.
- [57] O. Rashmanlou, S. Sahoo, R. A. Borzoei, M. Pal and A. Lakdashti, Computation of Shortest Path in a Vague Network by Euclidean Distance. J. of Multi Valued Logic & Soft Computing, Vol. 30, 2018, pp. 115-123.
- Valued Logic & Soft Computing, Vol. 30, 2018, pp. 115-123.

 [58] G. Kumar and R.K. Balaji and N. Gandotra, Algorithm for shortest path problem in a network with interval-valued intuitionistic trapezoidal fuzzy number. Procedia Computer Science, Vol. 70, 2015, pp. 123-129.
- 8 [59] A. Dey, A. Pal and T. Pal, Interval Type-2 Fuzzy Set in Fuzzy Shortest Path PROBLEM, Mathematics, Project: Fuzzy Shortest Path Problem, Vol. 4(62), 2016, pp. 1-19.
 - [60] S. K. A. Nayeem, A New Expected Value Model for the FSSP. Advances in Intelligent Systems and Computing, Vol. 236, 2014, pp. 209-215.
 - [61] A. R. Meenakshi and M. Kaliraja, Determination of Shortest Path in Interval Valued Fuzzy Networks. International Journal of Mathematical Archive, Vol. 3(6), 2012, pp. 2377-2384.
 - [62] F. T. Lin, Shortest Path Problem Based on Interval-valued Fuzzy Numbers and Signed Distance Defuzzification Method. 2009 Fourth International Conference on Innovative Computing, Information and Control, 2009, pp. 605-608.
 - [63] S.S. Biswas, Interval Valued Fuzzy Shortest Path in a Multigraph, Oriental Journal of Computer Science & Technology, Vol. 10, No.2, 2017, pp. 364-370.
 - [64] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea and F. Smarandache, Shortest path Problem on Single Valued Neutrosophic Graphs, 2017 International Symposium on Networks, Computers and Communications, 2017, pp. 1-8.
 - [65] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea and F. Smarandache and L. Vladareanu, Computation of Shortest Path Problem in a Network, with SV-Trapezoidal Neutrosophic Numbers, Proceedings of the 2016 International Conference on Advanced Mechatronic Systems, Melbourne, Australia, 2016, pp. 417-422.
- Neutrosophic Numbers, Proceedings of the 2016 International Conference on Advanced Mechatronic Systems, Melbourne, Australia, 2016, pp. 417-422.

 [66] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea and F. Smarandache, Shortest path Problem in a network with SV- Triangular Neutrosophic Numbers, 2017 IEEE International Conference on Innovations in Intelligent Systems and Applications, Gdynia, Poland, 2017, pp. 426-431.
 - [67] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea and F. Smarandache, Applying Dijkstra Algorithm for Solving Neutrosophic Shortest Path Problem, Proceedings of the 2016, International Conference on Advanced Mechatronics Systems, Melbourne, Australia, 2016, pp.412-416.
 - [68] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea and F. Smarandache, Shortest Path problem under Trapezoidal Neutrosophic Information, Computing Conference, 2017, pp.142-148.
 - [69] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache and L. Vladareanu, Shortest Path Problem under Triangular Fuzzy Neutrosophic Information, 10 th International Conference on Software, Knowledge, Information Management & Applications, 2016, pp. 169-174.
 - [70] S. Broumi, A.Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache and M. Ali, Shortest Path Problem under Bipolar Neutrosophic Setting, Applied Mechanics and Materials, Vol. 859, 2016, pp. 59-66.
 - [71] S. Broumi, A.Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache, K.P. Krishnan Kishore and R. Sahin, Shortest Path problem Under Interval Valued Neutrosophic Setting, Journal of Fundamental and Applied Sciences, Vol. 10(4S), 2018, pp. 168-174.
 - [72] S. Broumi, M. Talea, A. Bakali and F. Smarandache, Application of Dijkstra algorithm for solving interval valued neutrosophic shortest path problem, IEEE Symposium Series on Computational Intelligence, 2016, pp.1-6.
 - [73] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache, A. Dey and L. Son, Spanning Tree Problem with Neutrosophic Edge Weights, Procedia Computer Science, Vol. 127, 2018, pp. 190-199.
 - [74] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache and V. Ulucay, Minimum Spanning Tree in Trapezoidal Fuzzy Neutrosophic Environment, 8 th International Conference on Innovations in Bio-Inspired Computing and Applications, 2017, pp. 25-35.
 - [75] S. Broumi, M. Talea, A. Bakali, F. Smarandache and S.K. Patro, Minimum Spanning Tree Problem with Single-Valued Trapezoidal Neutrosophic Numbers, Advances in Intelligent Systems and Computing, Vo. 857, 2019, pp. 93-105.
 - [76] S. Broumi, M. Talea, M. Bakali, F. Smarandache and K.Ullah, Bipolar Neutrosophic Minimum Spanning Tree, Smart Application and Data Analysis for Smart Cities, 2018, pp. 201-206.
 - [77] M. Mullai, S. Broumi, A. Stephen, Shortest Path problem by minimal spanning tree algorithm using bipolar neutrosophic numbers, International Journal of Mathematics Trends and Technology, Vol. 46, No. 2, 2017, pp.80-87
 - [78] A. Dey, S. Broumi, L.H. Son, A.Bakali M.Talea and F. Smarandache, A new algorithm for finding minimum spanning trees with undirected neutrosophic graphs, Granular Computing, 2018, pp. 1-7.
 - [79] S. Broumi, A. Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache and P.K. Kishore Kumar, A new concept of matrix algorithm for MST in undirected interval valued neutrosophic graph, Chapter in book- Neutrosophic Operational Research, Vol. II, 2017, ISBN: 978-1-59973-537.
 - [80] S. Broumi, A.Bakali, M. Talea, F. Smarandache and R. Verma, Computing Minimum Spanning Tree in Interval Valued Bipolar Neutrosophic Environment, International Journal of Modeling and Optimization, Vol. 7, No. 5, 2017, pp. 300-304.
 - [81] V.Jeyanthi and Radhika V.S, Applying Floyd's Algorithm for Solving Neutrosophic Shortest Path Problems, International Journal of Mathematics Trends and Technology, Volume 61 Number 1, 2018,pp 58-63
 - [82] M.Eshaghnezhad, F. Rahbarnia, S. Effati, and A. Mansoori, An Artificial Neural Network Model to Solve the Fuzzy Shortest Path Problem, Neural Processing Letters, 2018, p.1-22, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11063-018-9945-y
 - [83] M.Abdel-Basset, M.Gunasekaran, M.Mohamed & N.Chilamkurti, A framework for risk assessment, management and evaluation: Economic tool for quantifying risks in supply chain. Future Generation Computer Systems, 90, 2019, 489-502.
 - [84] M. A.Basset, M.Mohamed, A. K.Sangaiah & V. Jain, An integrated neutrosophic AHP and SWOT method for strategic planning methodology selection. Benchmarking: An International Journal, 25(7), 2018, 2546-2564.
 - [85] M.Abdel-Basset, M.Mohamed & F. Smarandache, A Hybrid Neutrosophic Group ANP-TOPSIS Framework for Supplier Selection Problems. Symmetry, 10(6), 2018, 226.
 - [86] M.Abdel-Basset, M.Mohamed& F. Smarandache, An Extension of Neutrosophic AHP-SWOT Analysis for Strategic Planning and Decision-Making. Symmetry, 10(4), 2018, 116.
 - [87] M.Abdel-Basset, M.Mohamed, F.Smarandache, & V. Chang, Neutrosophic Association Rule Mining Algorithm for Big Data Analysis. Symmetry, 10(4), 2018, 106.
 - [88] Abdel-Basset, M., Mohamed, M., & V.Chang, NMCDA: A framework for evaluating cloud computing services. Future Generation Computer Systems, 86, 2018, 12-29.
 - [89] M.Abdel-Basset, Y.Zhou, M.Mohamed & V. Chang, A group decision making framework based on neutrosophic VIKOR approach for e-government website evaluation. Journal of Intelligent & Fuzzy Systems, 34(6), 2018, 4213-4224.
 - [90] M.Abdel-Basset, M.Mohamed, Y.Zhou & I. Hezam, Multi-criteria group decision making based on neutrosophic analytic hierarchy process. Journal of Intelligent & Fuzzy Systems, 33(6), 2017, 4055-4066.
 - [91] M. Abdel-Basset & M. Mohamed, The role of single valued neutrosophic sets and rough sets in smart city: imperfect and incomplete information systems. Measurement, 124, 2018, 47-55.
 - [92] M.Abdel-Basset, G.Manogaran, A.Gamal & F. Smarandache, A hybrid approach of neutrosophic sets and DEMATEL method for developing supplier selection criteria. Design Automation for Embedded Systems, 2018,1-22.